Does the global microbiota consist of a few cosmopolitan species?

Ramiro E Logares [™]

Limnology Div., Ecology Dept., Lund University, Lund, Sweden

[Keywords: cosmopolitanisms, endemics, microbes]

[Palabras clave: cosmopolitanismo, endémicos, microbios]

Biogeography studies the distribution of biodiversity over space and time. Currently, there is a strong debate on the biodiversity and biogeography of free-living microorganisms. For several years, morphological studies have promoted the idea that, at the global level, there is a relatively small number of cosmopolitan microbial species (Baas-Becking 1934; Finlay 2002, 2004; Fenchel 2005). This view has been the most popular until recently, when molecular data started to unveil a much more complex scenario. Within the realm of this controversy, the objectives of this work are twofold: a) to review the traditional viewpoints on microbial biodiversity and biogeography and, b) to present and discuss new molecular data which are challenging previous ideas.

Since the number of species relies on the chosen species definition, any discussion on biodiversity and biogeography needs to mention upon which species concept conclusions are based. So far, the Morphological Species Concept (MSC; species are groups of morphologically identical or very similar organisms (Futuyma 1998)) has been the most popular definition in studies on microbial biodiversity and biogeography. In a few cases, the Biological Species Concept (BSC; species are groups of interbreeding natural populations that are reproductively isolated from other such groups (Mayr 1942)) has been applied to microeuka-

ryotes where sexual reproduction is known (Andersen 1998). In a more controversial approach, a group of researchers working on prokaryotes have defined that organisms having more than 70% of DNA-DNA similarity belong to the same species (Wayne et al. 1987).

For years, the use of the MSC in microbial taxonomy has promoted the view that the global microbiota consists of a relatively small number of cosmopolitan species; 'the cosmopolitan view' (Finlay 2002, 2004). The most popular hypothesis for explaining this putative pattern claims that due to their small sizes and huge abundances, microbes have no geographical barriers for their dispersal (Fenchel 2005). As a consequence, there is little opportunity for genetic diversification and therefore, a low number of cosmopolitan species should be expected. In agreement with these ideas, Griffin et al. (2002) indicate that between 10¹⁸ and 10²⁰ microorganisms are transported annually through the atmosphere, making it difficult to imagine how topographic features of the Earth's surface could act as barriers for their dispersal. Morphological studies support the 'cosmopolitan hypothesis' by indicating that there would be less than 5.000 species of microbes, a number quite low in comparison with the estimated 750.000 species of insects or 280.000 of all other animals (Papke & Ward 2004).

A lack of biogeographic patterns and a low global diversity for free-living microbes has been the most accepted view until the advent of molecular studies. Interestingly, some molecular data support the 'cosmopolitan hypothesis' by showing a low genetic differentiation between populations separated by continental distances (e.g. Darling et al. 2000; Montresor et al. 2003a). However, there are mounting data revealing a very different picture, as it will be described and discussed in the following sections.

Is there a relatively low number of microbial species?

The technical limitations during the times of the early taxonomists were probably an important factor in generating a false impression of a low number of microbial species. For instance, before the arrival of the electron microscope there were 12 algal classes, while today more than 30 are recognized (Andersen 1998). Although more advanced microscopes have contributed significantly to improve our knowledge, they still have a limit of resolution. This limit is not only technological: it is widely recognized that there are different microbial species and/or genetically isolated strains that are virtually indistinguishable using morphological characters (cryptic species/strains).

It has been proposed that cryptic species/ strains are the product of natural selection exerting an important stabilizing force on particular morphologies that represent adaptive peaks (Potter et al. 1997; Finlay 2004). However, selection could be disruptive or absent on other areas of the genome. Thus, it would not be surprising if it is revealed that several well established microbial species defined on a morphological basis (morphospecies) are actually an agglomeration of a range of genetic and physiological strains/species that are morphologically undistinguishable. An increasing number of molecular studies are clearly pointing in this direction (e.g. Pace 1997; Potter et al. 1997; Daugbjerg et al. 2000; Coleman 1996, 2001a, 2001b; Casamatta et al. 2003; Kim et al. 2004; Wilson et al. 2005). Altogether, they are showing that several morphospecies are in fact composed of genetically divergent populations or cryptic species. For instance, Montresor et al. (2003b) carried out morphological and genetic studies on different populations of the cosmopolitan marine dinoflagellate *Scrippsiella trochoidea* and found that within the same morphotype, there are strains which show a genetic differentiation that is in the order of what is normally found between other dinoflagellate species. In the light of their data, it seems likely that the morphotype known as *Scrippsiella trochoidea* is actually a complex of cryptic species.

A good example of how similar morphologies can mask biodiversity comes from coccoid picoplanktonic algae, which are mere tiny (<5 µm) balls that are present in most oceans. According to Potter et al. (1997), the morphology of these microeukaryotes provides so little information that it is not possible to go lower than the taxonomical 'Class' level. Moreover, sexual reproduction was rarely observed, so the BSC could not be used to ascertain their species status. In order to investigate the biodiversity of these picoplankters, Potter et al. (1997) carried out genetic studies on the 'brown-type tiny balls', which were morphologically indistinguishable between each other. Interestingly, they found that, lumped together as 'brown tiny balls', there are members of three distinct eukaryotic groups: the heterokont, the haptophyte and the green algae.

Another factor that may have contributed to an underestimation of the number of microbial species is that most studies have been carried out on cultivable organisms. Today it is estimated that > 99 % of microorganisms are not cultivable using standard techniques (Aman et al. 1995; Oren 2004). During the last decade, phylogenetic data from ribosomal DNA (rDNA) sequences directly amplified from environmental samples (environmental DNA surveys), revealed an unexpected diversity of prokaryotes (Giovannoni et al. 1990; Fuhrman et al. 1992; Hugenholtz et al. 1998). More recently, the same approach was used on marine microeukaryotes, revealing not only an unsuspected high diversity, but also the presence of several novel organisms with unknown close relatives (López-Garcia et al. 2001; Moreira & López-Garcia 2002). For instance, Moon-van der Staay et al. (2001) used the environmental DNA approach to investigate the eukaryotic diversity in marine picoplankton. They took one plankton sample (<3 µm) at a depth of 75 m in the equatorial Pacific Ocean and sequenced the small-subunit (SSU) rDNAs present in the whole sample. They obtained 35 SSU rDNA sequences, most of which belong to previously unknown members of the phyla prasinophytes, haptophytes, dinoflagellates, stramenopiles, choanoflagellates and acantharians. Moreover, six sequences were forming a clade that cannot be assigned to any known eukaryotic taxonomic group. In another study, Dawson and Pace (2002) used the environmental DNA approach for investigating the microeukaryotic biodiversity in anoxic sediments. By sequencing the SSU rDNA from marine and lake samples, they detected many previously unrecognized eukaryotes, including representatives of seven lineages that are not related to any known organism. Using the 'whole-genome shotgun sequencing' technique to microbial plankton from the Sargasso Sea, Venter et al. (2004) found an unexpected high diversity of oceanic prokaryotes and microeukaryotes.

Considering these results, it becomes apparent that the hypothesis proposing a low global diversity for microbes does not agree with nature. Thus, assuming that the real microbial diversity is much higher than previously recognized, the next natural step is to investigate if there are patterns in the distribution of that diversity.

Are microbial species cosmopolitan?

The 'cosmopolitan hypothesis' predicts that microbes will be present in all environments where they can live due to unrestricted dispersal capabilities. Despite some molecular data support this hypothesis (e.g. Darling et al. 2000; Montresor et al. 2003a), multiple lines of evidence indicate that there are microbial species/strains with restricted geographical distributions (Vincent 2000; Wilson et al. 2005; Martiny et al. 2006). For instance, Whitaker et al. (2003) showed that, on a global scale, popu-

lations of the hyperthermophilic prokaryote, Sulfolobus, are geographically isolated from one another. In other words, thousands of kilometers of separation have left a genetic imprint in Sulfolobus. Additionally, high levels of endemicity were also found in soil bacteria (Fulthorpe et al. 1998) and in microbial eukaryotes. For example, in a study of testate amoeba, Wilkinson (2001) found that many species, with body sizes around 100 µm, are restricted either to the Arctic or the Antarctic. Several researchers indicate the existence of endemic lacustrine microalgae strains/species (Tyler 1996; Vincent 2000; Coleman 2001a; Casamatta et al. 2003; Taton et al. 2003; Wilson et al. 2005). Shayler and Siver (2004) mention the unique microalgal flora that is present in the Ocala National Forest (Florida, USA). Recent studies also show the existence of several genetically differentiated ecotypes within a marine planktonic cyanobacterium morphospecies (Coleman et al. 2006; Johnson et al. 2006).

Implications of new molecular data

Altogether, new molecular data indicate that: a) the diversity of free-living microbes is much higher than previously recognized and b) there are endemic as well as cosmopolitan species (e.g. Pace 1997; Fulthorpe et al. 1998; Glöckner et al. 2000; Massana et al. 2000; Sabbe et al. 2001, 2003; Wilkinson 2001; Taton et al. 2003; Whitaker et al. 2003; Oren 2004; Papke & Ward 2004; Martiny et al. 2006). This new knowledge has profound implications for the understanding of microbial diversification and biogeography. In particular, the discrepancy per se between molecular data and traditional concepts on the diversity and distribution of microbes, points to a very clear fact: we still know very little about the factors that promote the evolutionary diversification of microbes. The knowledge gained from approximately seven decades of evolutionary studies in macroorganisms is not enough to understand microbial diversification. This is due in large part to the fact that microbes normally differ from macroorganisms in having high dispersal, high reproductive rates and enormous individual abundances (Finlay 2002, 2004), all of which probably affect the tempo and mode of their evolution.

Geographical isolation has traditionally been regarded as the prevailing agent of microbial divergence (Papke & Ward 2004). However, molecular data suggest that local adaptation plays a significant role in microbial diversification (e.g. Rynearson & Armbrust 2000, 2004; Casamatta et al. 2003; Saez et al. 2003; Kim et al. 2004; Wilson et al. 2005; Coleman et al. 2006; Johnson et al. 2006). The role of natural selection in the divergence and eventual speciation of organisms in general has been recently reconsidered, receiving support from natural (Hendry et al. 2000; Rundle et al. 2000), laboratory (Rainey & Travisano 1998; Rainey et al. 2000) and theoretical (Doebeli et al. 2005) studies. In particular, there is increasing evidence that natural selection can generate exceptionally rapid divergences, as illustrated by the diverse macroorganisms that have colonized islands or lakes (Orr & Smith 1998; Coyne & Orr 2004). Evidence also indicates that natural selection can generate rapid divergences in microbes (Leblond et al. 2006; Logares et al. 2006).

Molecular data indicate that microbial dispersal can be restricted by distance and/or geographical features (e.g. Wilkinson 2001; Whitaker et al. 2003; Martiny et al. 2006). Following the classical speciation theory, dispersal restrictions will diminish gene flow between populations, which will then further diverge with time (by genetic drift and /or natural selection) to eventually form new strain/ species. However, even if there were microbial species which had no geographical barriers for their dispersal, gene flow between their populations would not necessarily have to be high. Local adaptation of different populations to particular environmental conditions can constitute a considerable barrier to gene flow by lowering the fitness of immigrants from other populations (De Meester et al. 2002). Thus, high dispersal would be compatible with the emergence and permanence of genetically differentiated populations/strains and eventually endemic species. The most controversial new evidence indicates that microbial diversification can occur in the presence of gene flow (Rainey & Travisano 1998; Rainey et al. 2000; Friesen et al. 2004). The genetic mechanisms underlying this type of divergence are still poorly understood.

To date, molecular techniques have been highly successful in the investigation of microbial biodiversity and biogeography, but new studies including more taxa from different locations are needed to gain a better understanding of microbial diversification, biodiversity and biogeography. It should always be remembered that most of the diversity of life is microscopic, thus, studying microbial diversification is necessary for understanding the process of evolution as a whole. There are also practical reasons for investigating microbial diversity and biogeography. For instance, in the search for novel drugs or compounds of commercial importance as well as in the fight against microbial diseases (like malaria) and microbial species that produce enormous economical loses (e.g. dinoflagellates during blooms).

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Special thanks to K. Rengefors, L. A. Hansson (Lund University) and J. Leblond (Middle Tennessee State University) for providing valuable comments and suggestions that helped to improve this manuscript. The Swedish Research Council and the SEED project contract, GOCE-CT-2005-003875 (European Commission Directorate General Research), to K. R. provided financial support.

REFERENCES

Amann, RI; W Ludwig & KH Schleifer. 1995. Phylogenetic Identification and in-Situ Detection of Individual Microbial-Cells without Cultivation. *Microbiol. Rev.* **59**:143-169.

Andersen, RA. 1998. What to do with Protists? *Aust. Syst. Bot.* 11:185-201.

Baas-Becking, LGM. 1934. Geobiologie of inleiding tot de milieukunde. Serie 18/19. Van Stockum's Gravenhange. The Hague, The Netherlands.

Casamatta, DA; ML Vis & RG Sheath. 2003. Cryptic species in cyanobacterial systematics: a case study of *Phormidium retzii* (Oscillatoriales) using RAPD molecular markers and 16S rDNA sequence data. *Aquat. Bot.* 77:295-309.

COLEMAN, AW. 1996. Are the impacts of events in the earth's history discernable in the current distributions of freshwater algae? *Hydrobiologia* 336:137-142.

- Coleman, AW. 2001a. Biogeography and speciation in the *Pandorina/Volvulina* (Chlorophyta) superclade. *J. Phycol.* 37:836-851.
- COLEMAN, AW. 2001b. Can DNA Sequencing Tell us anything about how freshwater algae travel? *J. Phycol.* **37**:13-14.
- COLEMAN, ML; MB SULLIVAN; AC MARTINY; C STEGLICH; K BARRY ET AL. 2006. Genomic islands and the ecology and evolution of *Prochlorococcus*. *Science* **311**:1768-1770.
- COYNE, JA & HA ORR. 2004. Speciation. Sinauer Associates. Massachusetts
- Darling, KF; CM Wade; IA Stewart; D Kroon; R Dingle et al. 2000. Molecular evidence for genetic mixing of Arctic and Antarctic subpolar populations of planktonic foraminifers. *Nature* **405**:43-47.
- Daugbjerg, N; G Hansen; J Larsen & O Moestrup. 2000. Phylogeny of some of the major genera of dinoflagellates based on ultrastructure and partial LSU rDNA sequence data, including the erection of three new genera of unarmoured dinoflagellates. *Phycol.* **39**:302-317.
- Dawson, SC & NR Pace. 2002. Novel kingdom-level eukaryotic diversity in anoxic environments. *PNAS* **99**:8324-8329.
- De Meester, L; A Gomez; B Okamura & K Schwenk. 2002. The Monopolization Hypothesis and the dispersal-gene flow paradox in aquatic organisms. *Acta Oecol. Int. J. Ecol.* 23:121-135.
- DOEBELI, M; U DIECKMANN; JAJ METZ & D TAUTZ. 2005. What we have also learned: Adaptive speciation is theoretically plausible. *Evolution* **59**:691-695.
- Fenchel, T. 2005. Cosmopolitan microbes and their 'cryptic' species. *Aquat. Microb. Ecol.* **41**:49-54.
- Finlay, BJ. 2002. Global dispersal of free-living microbial eukaryote species. *Science* **296**:1061-1063.
- Finlay, BJ. 2004. Protist taxonomy: an ecological perspective. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond.*, B **359**:599-610.
- Friesen, ML; G Saxer; M Travisano & M Doebell. 2004. Experimental evidence for sympatric ecological diversification due to frequency-dependent competition in *Escherichia coli*. *Evolution* **58**:245-260.
- Fuhrman, JA; K McCallum & AA Davis. 1992. Novel Major Archaebacterial Group from Marine Plankton. *Nature* **356**:148-149.
- Fulthorpe, RR; AN Rhodes & JM Tiedje. 1998. High levels of endemicity of 3-chlorobenzoate-degrading soil bacteria. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **64**:1620-1627.
- Futuyma, DJ. 1998. *Evolutionary Biology*. 3rd Ed. Sinauer Associates, Inc. Massachusetts.

- GIOVANNONI, SJ; TB BRITSCHGI; CL MOYER & KG FIELD. 1990. Genetic Diversity in Sargasso Sea Bacterioplankton. *Nature* **345**:60-63.
- GLÖCKNER, FO; E ZAICHIKOV; N BELKOVA; L DENISSOVA; J PERNTHALER ET AL. 2000. Comparative 16S rRNA analysis of lake bacterioplankton reveals globally distributed phylogenetic clusters including an abundant group of actinobacteria. *Appl. and Environ. Microbiol.* 66:5053-5065.
- GRIFFIN, DW; CA KELLOGG; VH GARRISON & EA SHINN. 2002. The global transport of dust An intercontinental river of dust, microorganisms and toxic chemicals flows through the Earth's atmosphere. *Am. Sci.* **90**:228-235.
- Hendry, AP; JK Wenburg; P Bentzen; EC Volk & TP Quinn. 2000. Rapid evolution of reproductive isolation in the wild: Evidence from introduced salmon. *Science* **290**:516-518
- Hugenholtz, P; BM Goebel & NR Pace. 1998. Impact of culture-independent studies on the emerging phylogenetic view of bacterial diversity. *J. Bacteriol.* **180**:4765-4774.
- JOHNSON, ZI; ER ZINSER; A COE; NP McNulty; EMS WOODWARD & SW CHISHOLM. 2006. Niche partitioning among *Prochlorococcus* ecotypes along ocean-scale environmental gradients. *Science* 311:1737-1740.
- Kim, E; L Wilcox; L Graham & J Graham. 2004. Genetically distinct populations of the dinoflagellate *Peridinium limbatum* in neighboring Northern Wisconsin lakes. *Microb. Ecol* 48:521-527
- Leblond, J; B Anderson; D Kofink; R Logares; K Rengefors et al. 2006. Fatty acid and sterol composition of two evolutionarily closely related dinoflagellate morphospecies from cold Scandinavian brackish and freshwaters. *Eur. J. Phycol.* In press.
- Logares, R; K Rengefors; A Kremp; K Shalchian-Tabrizi; A Boltovskoy et al. 2006. Phenotypically different microalgal morphospecies with identical ribosomal DNA: A case of rapid adaptive evolution? *Microb. Ecol.* In press.
- López-Garcia, P; F Rodríguez-Valera; C Pedros-Alio & D Moreira. 2001. Unexpected diversity of small eukaryotes in deep-sea Antarctic plankton. *Nature* **409**:603-607.
- MARTINY, JBH; BJM BOHANNAN; JH BROWN; RK COLWELL; JA FUHRMAN ET AL. 2006. Microbial biogeography: putting microorganisms on the map. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 4:102-112.
- MASSANA, R; EF DELONG & C PEDROS-ALIO. 2000. A few cosmopolitan phylotypes dominate planktonic archaeal assemblages in widely different oceanic provinces. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **66**:1777-1787.
- MAYR, E. 1942. Systematics and the Origin of Species.

- Columbia University Press. New York
- Montresor, M; C Lovejoy; L Orsini; G Procaccini & S Roy. 2003a. Bipolar distribution of the cystforming dinoflagellate *Polarella glacialis*. *Polar. Biol.* **26**:186-194.
- Montresor, M; S Sgrosso; G Procaccini & WHCF Kooistra. 2003b. Intraspecific diversity in *Scrippsiella trochoidea* (Dinophyceae): evidence for cryptic species. *Phycol.* 42:56-70.
- Moon-van der Staay, SY; R De Wachter & D Vaulot. 2001. Oceanic 18S rDNA sequences from picoplankton reveal unsuspected eukaryotic diversity. *Nature* **409**:607-610.
- Moreira, D & P López-Garcia. 2002. The molecular ecology of microbial eukaryotes unveils a hidden world. *Trends Microbiol.* **10**:31-38.
- Oren, A. 2004. Prokaryote diversity and taxonomy: current status and future challenges. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. B.* **359**:623-638.
- Orr, MR & TB Smith. 1998. Ecology and speciation. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **13**:502-506.
- PACE, NR. 1997. A molecular view of microbial diversity and the biosphere. *Science* **276**:734-740.
- Papke, RT & DM Ward. 2004. The importance of physical isolation to microbial diversification. *Fems Microbiol. Ecol.* **48**:293-303.
- POTTER, D; TC LAJEUNESSE; GW SAUNDERS & RA ANDERSON. 1997. Convergent evolution masks extensive biodiversity among marine coccoid picoplankton. *Biodiversity Conserv.* **6**:99-107.
- Rainey, PB; A Buckling; R Kassen & M Travisano. 2000. The emergence and maintenance of diversity: insights from experimental bacterial populations. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **15**:243-247.
- RAINEY, PB & M TRAVISANO. 1998. Adaptive radiation in a heterogeneous environment. *Nature* **394**:69-72.
- RYNEARSON, TA & EV ARMBRUST. 2000. DNA fingerprinting reveals extensive genetic diversity in a field population of the centric diatom *Ditylum brightwellii*. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **45**:1329-1340.
- RYNEARSON, TA & EV ARMBRUST. 2004. Genetic differentiation among populations of the planktonic marine diatom *Ditylum brightwellii* (Bacillariophyceae). *J. Phycol.* 40:34-43.
- Rundle, HD; L Nagel; JW Boughman & D Schluter. 2000. Natural selection and parallel speciation in sympatric sticklebacks. *Science* **287**:306-308.
- SABBE, K; K VANHOUTTE; RL LOWE; EA BERGEY; BJF

- BIGGS ET AL. 2001. Six new *Actinella* (Bacillariophyta) species from Papua New Guinea, Australia and New Zealand: further evidence for widespread diatom endemism in the Australasian region. *Eur. J. Phycol.* **36**:321-340.
- Sabbe, K; E Verleyen; DA Hodgson; K Vanhoutte & W Vyverman. 2003. Benthic diatom flora of freshwater and saline lakes in the Larsemann Hills and Rauer Islands, East Antarctica. *Antarct. Res.* 15:227-348.
- SAEZ, AG; I PROBERT; M GEISEN; P QUINN; JR YOUNG ET AL. 2003. Pseudo-cryptic speciation in coccolithophores. *PNAS* **100**:7163-7168
- SHAYLER, HA & PA SIVER. 2004. Description of a new species of the diatom genus *Brachysira* (Bacillariophyta), *Brachysira gravida* sp nov from the Ocala National Forest, Florida, USA. *Nova Hedwigia* 78:399-409.
- TATON, A; S GRUBISIC; E BRAMBILLA; R DE WIT & A WILMOTTE. 2003. Cyanobacterial diversity in natural and artificial microbial mats of Lake Fryxell (McMurdo dry valleys, Antarctica): A morphological and molecular approach. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **69**:5157-5169.
- Tyler, PA. 1996. Endemism in freshwater algae. *Hydrobiologia* **336**:127-135.
- VENTER, JC; K REMINGTON; JF HEIDELBERG; AL HALPERN; D RUSCH ET AL. 2004. Environmental genome shotgun sequencing of the Sargasso Sea. *Science* **304**:66-74.
- VINCENT, WF. 2000. Evolutionary origins of Antarctic microbiota: invasion, selection and endemism. *Antarctc. Sci.***12**:374-385.
- Wayne, LG; DJ Brenner; RR Colwell; PAD Grimont; O Kandler et al. 1987. Report of the ad hoc committee on reconciliation of approaches to bacterial systematics. *Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol.* 37:463-464.
- WHITAKER, RJ; DW GROGAN & JW TAYLOR. 2003. Geographic barriers isolate endemic populations of hyperthermophilic archaea. *Science* **301**:976-978.
- Wilkinson, DM. 2001. What is the upper size limit for cosmopolitan distribution in free-living microorganisms? *J. Biogeogr.* **28**:285-291.
- WILSON, AE; O SARNELLE; BA NEILAN; TP SALMON; MM GEHRINGER ET AL. 2005. Genetic variation of the bloom-forming cyanobacterium *Microcystis aeruginosa* within and among lakes: Implications for harmful algal blooms. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 71:6126-6133.